ORDER SHEET WEST BENGAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL

Present-

The Hon'ble Justice Ranjit Kumar Bag

& The Hon'ble Subesh Kumar Das

Case No - O<u>A 36 OF 2018</u>

ASHIM ROY CHOWDHURY <u>Vs</u> The State Of West Bengal & Ors.

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary
1 14.03.2018	For the Applicant : Mrs. Sunita Agarwal Learned Advocate	3
17.03.2010	For the Respondent: Mr. Biswa Priya Ray Learned Advocate	
	The applicant has filed the original application	
	under Section 19 of the Administrative Tribunals Act, 1985, challenging order communicated under letter dated	
	June 24, 2015, issued by the Deputy Secretary,	
	Department of Forests, Government of West Bengal as	
	illegal and arbitrary and praying for direction upon the	
	respondents to consider the representations submitted by	
	the applicant in connection with his compassionate	
	appointment.	
	The contention of the applicant is that one	
	Mahendra Ray Chowdhury died on November 17, 2011	
	while he was working as Deputy Ranger / Forester under	
	Gorumara Wildlife Division in the Forest Department,	
	Government of West Bengal. The applicant, being the son	
	and dependant of the deceased employee, submitted	
	informal application for compassionate appointment on	
	December 28, 2011 and application in prescribed format	

ORDER SHEET

ASHIM ROY CHOWDHURY

Vs.

The State of West Bengal & Ors.

Case No. <u>OA 36 OF 2018</u>		
Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3
	subsequently. The case of the applicant was considered	
	by the Divisional Forest Officer, Wildlife Division, II,	
	Jalpaiguri and forwarded the same to the Principal Chief	
	Conservator of Forests on February 14, 2013. Similarly,	
	the Additional Principal Chief Conservator of Forests,	
	Human Resources Development, Government of West	
	Bengal forwarded the case of the applicant to the Principal	
	Secretary, Department of Forests, Government of West	
	Bengal on September 11, 2014. However, the Department	
	of Forests, Government of West Bengal communicated its	
	inability to give appointment to the applicant on	
	compassionate ground due to long delay in submitting the	
	application and the said decision was communicated to the	
	Principal Chief Conservator of Forests (General),	
	Government of West Bengal by the Deputy Secretary,	
	Department of Forests, Government of West Bengal on	
	June 24, 2015 which is under challenge in the present	
	application. It is relevant to point out that the applicant has	
	submitted representations for reconsideration of the case	
	of the applicant subsequent to rejection of prayer of the	
	applicant for compassionate appointment.	
	Having heard the Learned Counsel representing	
	both parties and on consideration of the materials on	

Form No.

ORDER SHEET

ASHIM ROY CHOWDHURY

••••

Vs.

The State of West Bengal & Ors.

Order of the Tribunal with signature 2 record, we find that the applicant submitted informal application before the Divisional Forest Officer, Wildlife	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3
application before the Divisional Forest Officer. Wildlife	
"PP	
Division II, Jalpaiguri on December 28, 2011 though the	
application in the prescribed format was submitted	
subsequently. Since the informal application was	
submitted by the applicant within a period of one month	
and eleven days from the date of death of his father, we do	
not find any justification in rejecting the prayer of the	
applicant for compassionate appointment on the ground of	
delay. The formal application in the prescribed format,	
even if submitted after the time limit, the said delay	
cannot be attributed to the conduct of the applicant,	
particularly when the applicant was allowed to participate	
in the enquiry of Three-Men Committee on July 8, 2012.	
The contents of the order communicated under letter dated	
June 24, 2015 (Annexure P-7 to the original application)	
do not disclose that the respondent No. 1 has considered	
the need of immediate financial crisis in the family of the	
deceased employee for giving compassionate appointment	
to any of the dependant of the deceased employee. So, the	
impugned order communicated under letter dated June 24,	
2015 (Annexure P-7 to the original application) is set	
aside.	
I a s s a r a c e c F i J J c t i 2	Division II, Jalpaiguri on December 28, 2011 though the application in the prescribed format was submitted ubsequently. Since the informal application was ubmitted by the applicant within a period of one month and eleven days from the date of death of his father, we do not find any justification in rejecting the prayer of the applicant for compassionate appointment on the ground of lelay. The formal application in the prescribed format, even if submitted after the time limit, the said delay cannot be attributed to the conduct of the applicant, particularly when the applicant was allowed to participate in the enquiry of Three-Men Committee on July 8, 2012. The contents of the order communicated under letter dated tune 24, 2015 (Annexure P-7 to the original application) to not disclose that the respondent No. 1 has considered the need of immediate financial crisis in the family of the eleceased employee for giving compassionate appointment to any of the dependant of the deceased employee. So, the mpugned order communicated under letter dated June 24, 2015 (Annexure P-7 to the original application) is set

Form No.

ORDER SHEET

ASHIM ROY CHOWDHURY

Form No.

Vs.

The State of West Bengal & Ors.

Case No. OA 36 OF 2018				
Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3		
	The respondent No. 1, Principal Secretary,			
	Department of Forests, Government of West Bengal is			
	directed to reconsider the case of the applicant for			
	compassionate appointment on the basis of the materials			
	available on record including the report of the Three-Men			
	Enquiry Committee in accordance with the provisions of			
	notification No. 114-Emp dated August 14, 2008 issued			
	by the Labour Department, Government of West Bengal,			
	which was in force on the date of death of the father of the			
	applicant and by taking into consideration the date of			
	submission of application for compassionate appointment			
	as on December 28, 2011 - when informal application was			
	submitted by the applicant, within a period of twelve			
	weeks from the date of communication of the order and to			
	communicate the result of the same to the applicant within			
	a period of two weeks thereafter.			
	With the above direction, the original application is			
	disposed of.			
	Let a plain copy of the order be supplied to both			
	parties.			
SCN.	(S.K. Das) (R.K. Bag)			
	MEMBER (A) MEMBER (J)			